





Colloquium 2(58)/2025
ISSN 2081-3813, e-ISSN 2658-0365
CC BY-NC-ND.4.0
DOI: <http://doi.org/10.34813/19coll2025>

ADULT EDUCATOR – THE PROBLEMS OF PROFESSIONALIZATION

Edukator dorosłych – problemy profesjonalizacji

Zofia Szarota
Akademia WSB, Dąbrowa Górnicza
e-mail: zszarota@wsb.edu.pl
ORCID  0000-0002-6342-3153

Ryszarda Cierzniewska
Uniwersytet Ignatianum, Kraków
e-mail: ryszarda.cierzniewska@ignatianum.edu.pl
ORCID  0000-0003-3890-0082

Abstract

The professionalisation of adult educators is characterised by features that differ from the training processes of specialists in other fields of education. The aim of the study was to analyse the positions of international researchers and Polish practitioners regarding the need for specialised training of adult education staff. The study aimed to determine to what extent it can be considered that in a science-based society there is a separate professional category of adult educator. Three key research questions were adopted concerning: systemic qualification regulations, researchers' positions on the requirement for qualifications, and the expectations of Polish education organisers regarding the qualifications of educators. The research methods included a literature review and a case study (in-depth interviews with organisers and informal interviews with educators working in non-formal adult education). The conclusions point to neglect in the area of professional preparation of adult educators. The neoliberal market of Polish educational services has jurisdictional legitimacy only in the area of continuing education for adults. The study reveals the need for systematic professionalisation of the educator profession, as pointed out by both researchers and practitioners. The results of the study also indicate a lack of consistent standards and low methodical awareness in the Polish educator community. The article postulates the development of integrated educational programmes and the introduction of regulations supporting the professionalisation of educators.

Keywords: educator of adults, non-formal and informal adult education, andragogical pedeutology, professional qualifications of educators.

Streszczenie

Profesjonalizacja edukatorów dorosłych charakteryzuje się cechami, które różnią się od procesów kształcenia specjalistów w innych dziedzinach edukacji. Celem badania była analiza stanowisk międzynarodowych badaczy oraz polskich praktyków wobec potrzeby specjalistycznego szkolenia kadry edukacyjnej dla dorosłych. Badanie służyło określeniu, na ile w uczącym się społeczeństwie można mówić o istnieniu odrębnej kategorii zawodowej nauczyciela – edukatora dorosłych. Przyjęto trzy kluczowe pytania badawcze dotyczące: systemowych uregulowań kwalifikacyjnych, stanowisk badaczy wobec wymogu kwalifikacji oraz oczekiwań polskich organizatorów edukacji wobec kwalifikacji edukatorów. Metody badawcze obejmowały przegląd literatury i studium przypadku (wywiady pogłębione z organizatorami i wywiady swobodne z edukatorami działającymi w pozaformalnej edukacji dorosłych). Wnioski wskazują na zaniebdania w obszarze profesjonalnego przygotowania edukatorów dorosłych. Neoliberalny rynek polskich usług edukacyjnych ma jurysdykcyjną legitymizację jedynie w obszarze ustawicznego kształcenia dorosłych. Badanie ujawnia potrzebę systematycznej profesjonalizacji zawodu edukatora, na co zwracają uwagę zarówno badacze, jak i praktycy. Wyniki badania wskazują także na brak spójnych standardów oraz niską świadomość metodyczną w polskim środowisku edukatorów. W artykule postulowano rozwój zintegrowanych programów edukacyjnych oraz wprowadzenie regulacji wspierających profesjonalizację edukatorów.

Słowa kluczowe: edukator dorosłych, pozaformalna edukacja dorosłych, pedeutologia andragogiczna, kwalifikacje zawodowe edukatorów.

Introduction

When we have a toothache, we go to the dentist, not the blacksmith or the hairdresser. When we have a legal problem, we pay for the services of a lawyer rather than seek solutions from self-proclaimed 'experts'. Learning, as a social practice, has been supported by teachers for centuries. When seeking knowledge, we should therefore use qualified teachers. This is indeed the case in the education system, but does this state of affairs apply to adult lifelong learning? Unlike lawyers, doctors, engineers and other regulated professions, most adult education practitioners do not have specialised training and this is widely accepted. The heterogeneity of adult education in terms of recognised paradigms and didactic models, the organisational and methodological forms, objectives and content that they imply, the diversity of providers and the needs of adult education participants, renders the professionalisation of adult education challenging and prompts inquiries into the scope of educators' competences. As Bjarne (2016) argues, these need to be broad and flexible, which greatly complicates the role of the educator. Hence our intention to seek answers to the question of the contemporary contexts of the professional role of adult educators and the potential pathways for them to acquire and improve their qualifications.

When analysing the literature on the subject, one gets the impression that the issue of professionalisation of adult educators is not addressed in domestic social sciences, including pedagogy – adult education. We decided that it would be worthwhile to familiarise the reader with Polish solutions in this area, thus pointing out unique regional issues. We thought it worthwhile to acquaint the reader with Polish solutions in this area, thus pointing out unique regional issues.

The article assumes that the term “adult teacher” is synonymous with the term “(adult) educator” and denotes a person who directs the learning process of adults in various forms and cognitive spaces (environments). A teacher works within the education system, while an educator works outside the education system. A trainer is a person who performs tasks related to the training function (in terms of theory or practice) in an educational institution or in the workplace.

It is accepted that the term 'adult learning' refers to all forms of learning and education, whether formal, non-formal or informal, but specifically intended for adults who have completed their compulsory education or are participating in further and continuing education, courses or other forms of general development.

In order to distinguish between these concepts, another terminological point needs to be clarified. Qualifications are the formal requirements to be suitable for a position. They are usually gained through education, experience and improvement in a particular industry. They include level of education, field of study, years of experience, diplomas, certificates and licences, etc. Competence, on the other hand, refers to the ability to successfully perform the job tasks assigned.

Method

The aim of the study was to find out the positions of international researchers and Polish practitioners towards the need for specialised staff training for adult education. The exploration served to establish to what extent in a learning, information-based, neoliberal society is it legitimate to speak of a professional category of teacher/educator of adults?

Three key questions were formulated: 1) What are the systemic arrangements for the qualification of educators in different countries? 2) What is the position of researchers towards the requirement for educator qualifications? 3) What are the expectations of Polish education providers towards educator qualifications?

Research methods: literature review, case study with interviews.

Consensus.app and SciSpaces Deep Review tools were used for the literature review. The search sources were databases: Routledge, Sage, Scopus, Springer, search engines ResearchGate, Semantic Scholar and Google Scholar. Reviewed articles and monographs published in Polish and English were analysed. The research process was conducted in stages. The search in the resources of reference databases began with the formulation of a problem question, concerning the quality of educators' professional qualifications (Consensus.app). The material extracted and structured using SciSpaces Deep Review enabled critical insight and synthesis of partial results. The collected data: abstract, keywords, discussion and synthesis of results were subjected to secondary analysis. A list of texts selected for analysis can be found in the bibliography. Source texts from the resources of the Polish Digital Library Federation and the Polon portal were also studied. In parallel, grey literature, including publications by EPALE,

Euridice, the Council of Europe, the European Commission, the Polish Central Statistical Office (GUS), etc., was analysed. This procedure provided answers to the first two specific questions.

The answer to the third question was obtained through interviews with organisers of non-formal adult education.

Individual in-depth interviews with organizers and adult educators were used, as well as casual interviews with organizers of non-formal and informal education. The opening question to all organiser/educator interviewees was: *What factors determine hiring a particular person to teach in the company/institution you manage?* The second question, addressed exclusively to educators, asked them to assess their own educational competences.

The characteristics of the interviewees are shown in Table 1.

Table 1
Narrators' profiles

Organizers and educators						
Person	Education	Function in the company	City	Organizational seniority	Number of learners per year	Type of education
M 60-65	PhD, pedagogy	owner, educator	provincial city	30 years	6 – 130	non-formal, training in external companies
F 45-50	Philology... with teacher preparation, postgraduate in management in (...)	director, educator	district city	19 years	300	non-formal, intra-institutional training
Organizers						
F 50-55	PhD, pedagogy	head	provincial city	4 years	90	non-formal, postgraduate studium
F 60-65	Social Policy	director	provincial city	12 years	700	non-formal, quasi-diploma (honorary title)
F 70-75	Law	president	district city	20 years	305	informal
F 75-80	Pedagogy	head	district city	27 years	150	informal

Source: own research.

The in-depth interviews with organisers and educators lasted approximately 1.5 hours, the interviews with organisers between 21 and 28 minutes. The research ran from April 2023 to May 2024.

Towards andragogical pedeutology.

Conceptual framework of the modern meaning of the term

The concept of "andragogical pedeutology" was applied by Agnieszka Stopińska-Pająk (2003), who at the same time drew attention to the negligence in the training, further training and professional development of adult education teachers. The author admonished for a new concept of their training, stressing that in Poland there are no institutions training andragogists-practitioners. As a result, people who have not encountered andragogical problems work in the field of adult education.

Analysis of the meaning of the term "teacher (educator) of adults" is problematic. The term is sometimes defined as a social construct, a reflective practice, or a profession. An adult educator should be a person who practices a profession that facilitates adult learning by applying the principles of andragogy. A broader term is "trainer", which is sometimes used as a close word, but a trainer is not necessarily an adult educator, as he has other qualifications and is not associated with the field of schooling.

In the current educational discourse, there is a transit of the term "education" into the concept of "learning". We are dealing with the doctrine of lifelong learning regardless of age (lifelong learning, including later-life learning), with activity involving learning processes in various forms and places (life-wide learning), delving into areas of social, cultural, communicative, moral, spiritual values (life-deep learning) (Bozkurt & Ucar, 2020). A shift from the Enlightenment paradigm to the post-modern one, from a culture of collective learning to individual learning, is evident. The role of the educator is changing, "who is being transformed from an expert into a mentor of an individual, personalized educational path, an advisor – a *laissez-faire* supporting the adult in solving his existential problems [...]" (Szarota & Pierścieniak, 2020, p. 185). The teacher becomes a designer of the educational space, an arranger of situations conducive to the process of learning from life and a facilitator of adult learning.

Pedagogical constructivism is a historically and scientifically grounded, ethically grounded, dynamically developing theory. In its view, learning is a personal act, the result of the activity of an individual who processes data in accordance with his own expectations, past experiences, previously accumulated knowledge and skills. The construction of knowledge takes place continuously, but the essence of the differences in the quality of knowledge depends on the circumstances of its formation. The conditions of the cognitive process, in which the production of one's own meanings takes place, the formation of one's own structure as a result of the accommodation of knowledge, are crucial both for its quality and for knowledge about oneself and the world. Constructivism is not so much about the effect as about the path of cognition. Learning occurs in teaching situations or occasions that can be provoked or the naturalness of their occurrence can be exploited. Learning requires cognitive dissonance and, against this background, critical thinking, from which we remember not so much

the results as the problem-solving procedures. All normativism and external goal-setting are a negation of this process, especially since many aspects of learning are not subject to conscious meta-analysis on the part of the learner and the “teacher” who controls the process (Klus-Stańska, 2018). Normativity applies not only to education, but to all of life, as it gives the illusion of meeting standards that give meaning to human existence. With progress and competitiveness, it is freedom and autonomy that have become the main slogan of “lifelong learning” the constant rush for new qualifications, and the rusher does not even notice that he is constantly imperfect, not good enough, inefficient and insatiable (Cierzniewska, 2017).

The relationship between pedagogy and andragogy (adult education) is characterized by a dichotomous perspective (Loeng, 2023), which sees these sciences as separate and representing different approaches to education. In this view, pedagogy focuses more on the teacher, while andragogy focuses on the learner, treating his or her teaching as an aid to the process of individual development. One of the basic tenets of andragogy is to view adult education and learning (hereafter: ALE) as a process that differs from the education of school-age children and adolescents. Hence the conclusion: teachers in adult schools and educators in non-formal education should have additional qualifications derived from andragogical claims.

Researchers consider adult educators to be key actors in a knowledge-based society. The discussion of their qualifications has been going on for decades. In order to avoid the charge of Eurocentrism, we will signal the situation in global terms (excluding Africa).

Concern for teacher professionalism has been part of the goals of the US Commission of Professors of Adult Education (CPAE) since 1955. CPAE is part of the American Association of Adult and Continuing Education (AAACE, 2024), which is active in the field of education and provides a forum for discussing issues related to the academic preparation of adult teachers.

According to Asian researchers, the creation of a learning society requires continuous adult education. Its development and proper functioning, in turn, requires qualified teachers. This is also important from an adult literacy perspective, as evidenced by the example of India (Shah, 2009). Strengthening the core competencies of Thai teachers can improve adult education outcomes (Chayanopparat, Charungkaittikul and Ratana-Ubol, 2016). Singapore has recognized this demand and, as part of the SkillsFuture initiative, has defined qualification requirements for adult teachers and developed pathways for achieving the required qualifications (Chen, Pavlova, & Ramos, 2021). According to these, at least 80% of trainers and assessors employed by public training institutions must hold the WSQ Advanced Certificate in Training and Assessment or Advanced Certificate in Learning and Performance or equivalent (Institute for Adult Learning Singapore, 2024).

Issues of adult education personnel have been busy with a number of transnational associations. In Latin America, there is the Consejo de Educación de Adultos de América Latina (CEAAL). In Asian countries, there is the Asia and South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education (ASPBAE). The Center for the Study of Lifelong Learning in the Asia-Europe Meeting (ASEM LLL) leads cooperation between the two continents, and the International Council on Adult Education (ICAE) is a global body. These networks contribute to the development of an international community of adult education professionals (Lattke & Jütte, 2015).

The aim of the European Association for the Education of Adults (EAEA) and the European Society for Research on Adult Education (ESREA) is to promote and disseminate research on ALE in Europe. At the beginning of the new millennium, the professionalization of adult educators was identified as one of the greatest and most difficult challenges in Europe. The Electronic Platform for Adult Learning in Europe (EPALE) was launched by the European Commission in 2015. Its aim is to promote cooperation and the exchange of information in the field of adult learning in Europe. EPALÉ provides a place (website, platform, conferences, “ambassadors”) where adult learning professionals can share their knowledge, experiences, practices, materials and resources.

European Union member states have different models for adult education. The right to education, training and lifelong learning is enshrined in the European Pillar of Social Rights. In European political discourse and andragogical research, little attention has been paid to defining the content and processes of ALE teacher education and in-service training (Sava & Lupou, 2009). In the absence of organizational and methodological solutions, the system of validating informal competencies has been considered as an alternative solution (Andersson, et al., 2013).

Adult learning is a priority of the European education area for the period 2021-2030. The Resolution of the Council of the European Union on the adult learning agenda, emphasized the importance of professionalization and professional development of adult educators and trainers, called for improvement of their professional status and support for vocational education and training (European Commission, 2023).

Adult teachers are considered specialists who select educational content and guide the adults they teach to choose it appropriately (Specht & Loreit, 2021). Formal and non-formal ALE requires the presence of a lecturer, instructor, specialist, expert. Adult self-education can be supported by a consultant, in the work environment by a mentor or coach, and in life problem solving by a certified coach or interventionist. The trainer's task is to coordinate and direct the educational process. At the same time, he or she should be an educational consultant and mentor to the team (Giannoukos, et al., 2016). Other roles assigned to educators include animator and facilitator of ALE processes (Zagir & Mandel, 2020). Each of these and many other roles of an educator requires content knowledge, but also knowledge of the psychology of the adult, methodological

skills for working with the individual, group and collective, social competence. Adults want to be treated as subjects and partners, have an aversion to behavioral methods of teaching, value the accessibility and attractiveness of the transmission of content, while appreciating the substantive competence of the educator.

How, then, is the process of acquiring and improving the professional qualifications of educators organized?

Some countries require certified teaching qualifications. For example, in the United States, a bachelor's degree in education or a related field and a specialization in adult education is required (Career Explorer, 2024), and American “adult educators work in all walks of life” (Gouthro, 2019, p. 73).

In European Union countries, teachers have few opportunities to learn about adult learning. There are also no proposals for professional development. Nicoletta Ioannou (2023) reviewed key European documents from the past two decades and found that there is a lack of specialized programs and regulated procedures to guarantee the quality of educators' professional preparation. As a result, today's Europe's majority of adult educators are self-taught.

As a general rule, teachers of formal adult education should have a university degree and a first- or second-level pedagogical qualification. Some countries, such as the Czech Republic (Veteška & Kolek, 2017), Slovakia (Krystoň & Rovňanová, 2021) and Greece (Kucukaydin & Cranton, 2012) offer adult education programs within academic departments that include disciplines such as teacher education, psychology or training and development. Greek teachers have certified educational competencies in general adult education and vocational training. The Kingdom of the Netherlands has a law on adult education and vocational training. In the adult teaching profession, a diploma from a pedagogy, vocational college or university is mandatory. At least three years of experience in a field related to the course in which the teacher is to teach is required. Specialized qualifications are also required in Denmark. For teachers involved in general adult education, training in the fundamentals of adult pedagogy is required in addition to a university degree. Teachers must have a bachelor's or master's degree in pedagogy and, in the case of adult vocational education, a diploma from at least a vocational upper secondary school and at least three years of relevant work experience. In addition, a qualification as an educator in adult education equivalent to a degree in pedagogy is required. Maltese citizens who wish to work as adult educators must have a master's degree, a bachelor's degree in pedagogy (with honors), a post-graduate degree in pedagogy, a bachelor's degree in humanities, a diploma in adult education, a national diploma in adult teaching (Euridice, 2023).

Formal training of teachers and trainers in adult education offers benefits to individuals and society. The need to invest in their professional development is critical

to the quality of adult education, and educators have an important role to play in preparing people of all backgrounds and ages to live, learn and work (Karanikola & Panagiotopoulos, 2023).

Positive changes are also taking place in Ukrainian adult education, which is expanding its objectives, fields of study and variety of educational formats, and is being given a flexible structure. However, it is still based on traditional pedagogical principles and learning technologies, which significantly reduces its effectiveness (Lutsan 2021). The Ukrainian Parliament has established a subcommittee on continuing and out-of-school education. In 2021, the Adult Education Committee was established within the Public Council of the Ministry of Education and Science. The National Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine has a Department of Vocational Training and Adult Education. In 2015, the Ukrainian Association for Adult Education became a member of the European Association for the Education of Adults (Nychkalo et al., 2022). Despite the challenges of war, Ukraine is taking strategic steps to develop adult education as part of the country's reconstruction. The armed conflict has had a significant impact on access to education through the destruction of educational infrastructure and the shortage of teaching staff. The system's response to these problems is to introduce education vouchers and free vocational courses (European Training Foundation, 2023). The Law on Adult Education (Zakon Ukrainy "Pro osvitu doroslykh" 2022) will be the legal regulator of the rules and standards of adult education in Ukraine.

Preparation of cadres for educational work with adults in Poland

Polish legislation lacks a definition of an adult teacher, although the Poles have a long and beautiful tradition of adult education, popularization work, extracurricular education, including a book dated 1913, *Praca oświatowa – jej cele, metody, organizacja* (*Educational work – its tasks, methods, organisation*) (Bobrowski et al., 1913), considered the first textbook in this field (Bobrowski, i inni, 1913) and numerous methodological studies dating to the late 19th and first half of the 20th century, particularly in the field of adult literacy and self-education, including an elementary book titled *Obrazowa nauka czytania i pisanie* (*The Picture Learning of Reading and Writing*) by Kazimierz Promyk (1879). The primer gained international fame and was named the best in the world at the International Exhibition of the London Pedagogical Society in 1893.

The profession of adult educator in Poland has evolved differently than in Western countries. This divergence is primarily due to the historical context, especially the more than one hundred years of lack of state independence and the increased need for educational activities that fostered the preservation of a sense of national identity. Theoretical basis of adult education in Poland was rooted in pedagogy rather than psychoanalysis, as is often the case in other regions. Socio-cultural work was, and is, an important aspect of Polish adult education. Thus, the figure of the educator can

have community worker characteristics (Theiss & Bron, 2014). The postulate of professionalisation of the profession, which was raised in the research, concerns educators who pursue didactic rather than social goals.

Educators of the 20th century had a mainly substitute, compensatory function to perform, and in the professional development stream, a function proper, modernizing workforce competencies (Szarota, 2019). In Polish publications dating back to the 1990s, a teacher of adults was regarded as a suitably qualified person who conducts multifaceted educational activities with adults (informational, instructional, advisory, consultative, mediating, re-qualifying, educational, therapeutic, etc.). (Marczuk, 1996, str. 338-339). This was a consequence of Poland's long tradition of popular and general education (including underground, clandestine education), but also of the political system of 1944-1989, in which the education of society was to be an instrument of its political and ideological indoctrination. The industrialization of the country required intensive further education and in-service training for the staff of many enterprises and workplaces.

In modern Poland, the qualifications of adult education teachers vary depending on the context in which education is conducted. Educational policy with regard to ALE is characterized by a chaotic legal framework, fragmented methodological and organizational structures, and strong pressure from the labor market (Mazurkiewicz, 2009). Teachers working in adult schools or other institutions of the school system¹ are not expected to have andragogical competence that takes into account the subjective diversity of students (psychological criteria and adult socio-developmental potential) and the organizational and methodological approaches that result from these differences. The Education Law of December 14, 2016 (Dziennik Ustaw 2023 pos. 900) states: "The educational system provides (...) opportunities for adults to complete general education, acquire or change professional and specialized qualifications". Adults can learn in adult schools, colleges and post-secondary schools, continuing education institutions, vocational training centers and industry skill centers, which operate on the basis of the Education Law and the regulations of the Minister of National Education, including on continuing education in non-school forms. Hence the conclusion that lifelong learning for adults has been equated with continuing education in Poland. Proof of this claim can be found in the content on the Ministry of Education's website, which mentions vocational training and adult learning in a single paragraph (*Departament...*, 2023).

¹ For those with low qualifications or those wishing to acquire new qualifications, the system offers: 1) a qualifying vocational course; 2) a vocational skills course; 3) a general competency course; 4) a theoretical retraining course for young workers; 5) a course, other than those listed in items 1-3, that allows for obtaining and supplementing knowledge, skills and professional qualifications (Dziennik Ustaw z 2023 pos. 900).

It is possible to obtain certificates of free market qualifications. An example is the silhouette of a person engaged in *Designing didactic processes in remote education of adults* – level 6 of the Polish Qualifications Framework:

The person (...) independently designs and prepares various forms of remote education (e.g. online courses, webinars, video tutorials). Uses advanced knowledge of the functionality of various online courses and applies it in the creation of concepts and scenarios for various forms of remote learning. (...) also uses knowledge of didactics, principles of andragogy and remote learning methodologies when creating course concepts. (...) may find employment as an instructional designer, e-learning specialist or remote learning methodologist, among others. (Serwis Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, 2023b)

Academic training of future specialists in adult education (Wesołowska, 1994a, 1994b) has been carried out for decades by universities and colleges as part of their programs of study in pedagogy, where andragogy is a major subject:

In the past there was more emphasis on educator training. I drew on the resources of older colleagues. Today, those with the highest qualifications are the fewest. We andragogists are the fewest. We have the belief that knowledge will defend itself. There are too few of us, we are a strange variety of practitioners. [M 60-65]

Modern universities run specialization paths, andragogy faculties or postgraduate studies in this field. However, employers are unlikely to identify the terms “andragogy”, “educator”, and do not see the connection between the exceptional and unique competencies of educators and the possibility of improving their own staff. All the more so because a dizzying career is being made by ambiguous terms such as “training” and “trainer”, which are replacing the entrenched names in Polish tradition: instructor, lecturer, course. Trainers involved in adult education in companies run by legal entities or individuals outside the educational system do not have the status of teachers, and the qualification requirements for instructors, trainers, lecturers, coaches are set by the companies concerned. It seems that an organization that expects its employees to continuously improve their skills also takes responsibility for its services. Meanwhile, the Human Capital Survey (2022-2021) shows that 72% of education providers consider the level of their own professional staff to be optimal and, worryingly, see no need to develop them (Worek, Górniak, & Kubica, 2022).

The Academic Andragogical Association (ATA), which has been in existence since 1993, creates a platform for the exchange of scientific thought in Poland, organizing conferences, seminars and debates, publishing the *Rocznik Andragogiczny (Andragogical Yearbook)*, the semi-annual *Edukacja Dorosłych (Education of Adults)* and patronizing the publishing series *Biblioteka Edukacji Dorosłych (Library of Adult Education)* (Maliszewski, 2023). ATA in 2011 developed a professional silhouette of an andragogist, taking into account substantive competencies and potential places of employment. The profession is included in the classification of professions and specialties

under the number 235101 (Skibińska, 2012, p. 87). In the current *Classification of Occupations and Specialties...* (Dz. U. 2018, item 227) andragogist still has the number 235101 and is in the group: Teaching specialists. Closely related names are: adult educator, instructor of adult educational activities, adult teacher, adult human education specialist, specialist in adult educational development programs, specialist in supporting adult educational development. “Andragog conducts multifaceted educational activities (informational, instructional, advisory, consultative, mediating, educational, therapeutic, cultural and other) with adults” (Informacja o zawodzie, 2018, p. 6).

The professional role is a dynamic and multidimensional construct that requires continuous support, reflection and adaptation to changing realities. The problematisation of this issue makes it possible to identify key challenges, such as competence mismatches, role conflicts or social pressures, and points to the need for a systemic approach to professional development. Nicoletta Ioannou (2023) points to the lack of regulated procedures and specialised programmes to prepare educators with competency deepening and professional development processes. And although adult educators play a key role in ensuring the quality of adult education, there is a serious lack of specialised professional development programmes and regulated procedures for their preparation.

There is no clear definition of adult educator in Polish legislation, although at the turn of the century the term “adult educator” was introduced into the legal regulation of non-formal educational practice. The condition for obtaining the qualification was a successfully passed examination.² Nowadays, coaching courses or individual qualifications defined by the employing organisations are often sufficient in training institutions: “In the business market I have never come across a person certified as an educator, instead there are trainers of all kinds. There are freelancers with different competences in this market”. [M 60-65]

The professional preparation of adult teachers is a challenge. It requires specialised training programmes and certification. The regulations governing continuing education for adults in Poland apply only to teachers who work with various types of institutions, including public ones, such as adult schools, continuing education institutions, continuing education centres. Non-formal educators, on the other hand, cooperate, for example, with institutions offering courses for the unemployed and

² An educator could be a person with a master's degree and with knowledge and skills in andragogy and general didactics, as well as in area-specific detailed didactics, and confirmed by a certificate of completion of an accredited qualification course. The training program included compulsory subjects and adult teaching methodology at a minimum of 160 hours, practical classes – 60 hours, including at least 20 hours subject to hospitalization, independent conduct of various forms of education – 60 hours, and taking the qualification exam. The regulation governing the mode of qualification of an educator was in effect until October 2002.

jobseekers, conduct various training courses in companies, introduce ITC into work practice, and provide services aimed at improving the human capital of employees:

We have proposed a new staff development programme. It runs for 3 years, twice a month. In it, we create a self-development programme. We accompany the development of the employee. A person comes to work and performs various tasks. We help to solve them. We try to turn her deficits into strengths. [M 60-65]

Other educators work in spaces for the dissemination of knowledge and culture:

We operate at the municipal cultural centre, we are funded by the city. The listeners pay a small fee for selected activities, such as lectures, talks. There is a permanent, very large cultural and educational offer, there is a cabaret, a dance group, a vocal group, you can learn to dance, there is gymnastics, there are excursions. [F 75-80]

Interviewees' statements confirm that the ALE has a diverse character in terms of organisation and services. A non-formal and informal current can be distinguished. The non-formal stream includes companies and institutions that educate through:

1) business activities:

I have a business licence and a registered company. I acquire clients through competitive enquiries. They are companies from the private sector, local authorities organising training for their employees. The content of my offer is marketing and educational problems, according to the expectations of a specific company. [M 60-65]

2) postgraduate studies (universities):

I have not yet had the experience of organising postgraduate studies with funds from outside the university and in partnership with other entities. It was quite a difficult experience. But I conducted two editions, the students were satisfied. Now I have the satisfaction. [F 50-55]

Non-formal education is implemented through:

1) running the tasks of local government units:

I am the director who built... [a local government institution – author's note] from scratch. [...] we are social educators, with our work we accompany people experiencing difficult situations, but we also educate local communities participating in the process of social change. We organise conferences with academics, run a national newspaper, the only one in the country, lectures are held, and we have created a space for people to express their own opinions and views. [F 45-50]

2) Open education within the university:

I organise classes according to a schedule and yearbook, I have some administrative staff, I wouldn't be able to do it myself. The classes are direct and hybrid, there are directional lectures, language conversations, seminars, there are compulsory and optional classes, there are learning walks, there is a lot going on. Students pay a semester tuition fee, set by order of the rector. There are additional fees for extra classes. [F 60-65]

3) Educational activities at the association:

I employ staff on contract work or specialists with project money. If it wasn't for the projects, I wouldn't be able to manage. It's an association, so there's no income other than grants

and students' tuition fees. And the tuition fees are only 100 zloty a year! People here are not wealthy, I don't want to raise fees. [F 70-75]

An adult educator most often works as a freelancer or it is his/her additional paid work. What are the criteria for inviting educators (lecturers, instructors)? It appears that interviewees are most likely to invite people who are known to themselves and have an established reputation:

I have 30 years of practice, so I invite people I know, who I have met in the past. I trust competence, not a formal degree. Now I work with a political scientist, a specialist in marketing and management, a specialist in special education. Generally, these are people from the social sciences. Sometimes I invite colleagues from my university. [M 60-65]

I invite colleagues from the psychology community. We need an interdisciplinary scientific community, that is, a community of educators, psychologists, sociologists. But it is also useful for us here to have medicine, psychiatry broadly understood, so that we can just, hmm, build something that is just needed for these times. [F 50-55]

People from universities, experts, people from the ministry, practitioners. [F 55-60]

Lecturers are university staff, professors. They are the ones I have to employ first, they have it accounted for in the salary. [F 60-65]

I have had the opportunity and good fortune to meet so many wonderful, interesting people. Their inner beauty wings me, they give me satisfaction, happiness. They are passionate people, people who dedicate their lives to their passions. I call them and invite them. They almost never refuse me. [F 75-80]

Evaluation of learning activities is used in non-formal education:

I have a look at the evaluation questionnaires filled in by the trainees. This way I know what they liked and what needs to be changed. I call randomly selected participants to ask them to evaluate. [M 60-65]

There was an evaluation survey after each class, everyone was evaluated by the learners. [F 55-60]

Soft skills are important in the non-formal education stream:

We don't ask for qualifications and quite often we are disappointed. One lady has a pedagogical background, I do not control her. Besides, I constantly monitor the course of the classes. Many lecturers don't know how to teach a class. And here you have to have good diction, speak slowly. A listener once said to me, 'It doesn't matter who, it doesn't matter what, it matters how!'. There are classes that I didn't expect to be successful, meanwhile the success is determined by the methodological skills of the lecturer in question. [F 60-65]

Lecturers are specialists, we don't verify their diplomas. The professor comes, the applause of the audience is the best evaluation. [F 70-75]

The evaluation belongs to the participants, if they are satisfied then there is attendance. [F 75-80]

Public institutions in Poland are still using the technological methods derived from the technological stream, verbal methods, while entities of the free education

and training market have switched to methods based on individual competence development. What is the awareness of the methodological difference of working with adults, of the knowledge of adult education? Statements were in favour of andragogical theories:

(...) I associated teaching with the behavioural experience of imparting knowledge, and from the beginning I was more of a companion, a coach, now I can call it that, who participates in some kind of change. This led me to adult education. (...) I learned how to teach adults and to look for workshop solutions. (...) I am (...) an educator, a creator, I have a sense of participating in a process. I have good social skills. I have interesting ideas, well, but I also have a pedagogical background from my studies, I looked in the literature, I looked at how other trainers dealt with such forms. I also listened to people. Often they would say: “we’re fed up with these lectures, we don’t want to listen to this”, so I think to myself – you have to activate the trainees. They need to feel the theme of the event they are participating in, they need to feel that the reins are also in their hands, or that they are co-managers. (...) I already have the confidence that there is a need for andragogical education, adults learn differently. (...) today I can say that I enjoy adult education, it gives me satisfaction. [F 45-50]

There have been attempts to colonise ALE by some professional bodies, through, for example, knowledge certification, which is a kind of anointing of such a trainer – but not a teacher after all. The Polish Chamber of Training Companies has introduced the belief that a better standard is provided by a person with a coaching certificate, but issued by the Chamber. I do not agree with this. I am for competition in a free market. Everyone has the right to compete for the offer. Competition generates its optimisation. (...) Andragogists are hired when it is necessary to change the pace of classes, to make them more varied, to introduce methodological innovations. [M 60-65]

It is necessary to take care of the educators' professional identity, the andragogical identity. However, working with adults is governed by its own laws. [F 55-60]

There would need to be courses for educators on adult education methodology. The subject itself doesn't give much, what matters is how you talk to people. [F 60-65]

Conclusions

In many countries there is no formal route to an adult educator qualification and it is not expected or included in non-formal education. Perhaps this is a consequence of the fact that ALE is a voluntary process. As Shah (2009) notes, the perception is that short-term projects do not require professionals with a degree.

ALE practice is characterised by a multiplicity of actors, levels and spaces that span the public, private and non-profit sectors, with teachers and learners coming from diverse backgrounds (Galloway & Edwards, 2017; Ioannou, 2023). Public policy primarily supports formal education, despite the stated interest and commitment to activities that support lifelong learning. Adult education is dominated by non-accredited and informal learning spaces located outside the governmental educational framework. Paradoxically, the professionalisation of adult educators has lost ground with

the emergence of LLL, as the focus of education policy has shifted to learning outcomes (Singh, Molina-Naar & Ehlers, 2020).

Those in the roles of trainers, coaches and facilitators are not asked about their initial competences (Grotlüschen et al., 2024). Teachers tend to be freelancers as they do not have the opportunity to work full-time in educational institutions. Those who are employed “by the hour” find it difficult to access professional development.

In addition, one can speak of a crisis in thinking about the theory and didactics of adult education, as teachers and trainers do not have modern textbooks for theoretical and methodological preparation (Aleksander, 2022).

While adult education used to be an important social task (Szarota, 2019), today it is also a profitable business. The extensive academic qualifications of educators have been replaced by the content of coaching courses. We used to think of education as a tool to stimulate the fullest possible human development. Today we see it as a tool for the economic success of society and the individual, an adaptation to postmodern uncertainty and consumption. In the training market, the emphasis has shifted from the pedagogical/andragogical space to management and marketing. Education has become a business and knowledge a commodity – a product. Today we do not strive for erudition, cultural knowledge, but for “knowledge pills”, which we acquire through micro-education and information acquisition: what, how, where and who, but no longer why and for what purpose?

In Poland, ALE is on the margins of academia and society. Less than 20 per cent of 18-69 year-olds participate in non-formal educational activities (GUS, 2024). The percentage seems small, but in numbers it is 5.6 million people! As many as 83 per cent of people aged 25-64 developed their competences through formal, non-formal or informal learning in the last 12 months preceding the survey (Worek, Górnica, 2022). We believe that high quality professionals – educators – are essential for these individuals.

In conclusion, the formal requirements for adult teachers in Poland are insufficiently regulated. Although school teachers must have pedagogical and subject qualifications, there are no uniform criteria for adult educators. Jakimiuk (2019) points to the need to introduce an andragogy module into academic training programmes and to create qualification standards. She also stresses that the professionalism of adult educators requires not only appropriate documents confirming their competence, but also continuous improvement of knowledge and skills in the context of dynamically changing educational needs.

It is worth noting here that a new type of educator is emerging in the free market of educational services – the adult learning facilitator. His or her role is to design and manage the learning process, advise and assess competences. The facilitator will build

educational programmes, ensure their quality, design and select appropriate technologies for educational processes (Institute for Adult Learning Singapore, 2024). As the interviewee stated:

People with andragogical education should be “competent judges” today, they don't have to teach. They should evaluate programmes, for example coaching courses, ensure their quality. They should be a stimulus, not a dam in the transformation of adult education, reviewing, consulting, prompting, stimulating, not fighting change. [M 60-65]

Interviews with practitioners allowed us to reflect on the profession of adult educator in Poland. The current professional situation of educators is not strengthened by the systematic acquisition and improvement of their competences. The chaotic legal framework, labour market pressures and client expectations cause the profession of adult educator to lose its pedagogical (andragogical) foundations.

REFERENCES

- AAACE: American Association for Adult and Continuing Education. (2024, January 12). *Commission of Professors of Adult Education (CPAE)*. <https://www.aaace.org/page/CPAEHome>
- Aleksander, T. (2022). Twórcy polskiej dydaktyki dorosłych. *Rocznik Andragogiczny*, 29, 45–61; <https://doi.org/10.12775/RA.2022.004>
- Andersson, P., Köpsén, S., Larson, A., & Milana, M. (2013). Qualification paths of adult educators in Sweden and Denmark. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 35(1), 102–118; <https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2012.712036>.
- Bjarne, W. (2016). Adult educators' core competences. *International Review of Education*, 6(3), 343–353; <https://doi.org/10.1007/S11159-016-9559-4>.
- Bobrowski, T., Daszyńska-Golińska, Z., Dziubińska, J., Gargas, Z., Heilpern, M., Kruszewska, Z., Krzywicki, L., Orsetti, M., Orsza, H., Posner, S., Stępowski, M., Szydłowski, T., Weychert-Szymanowska, W. (1913). *Praca oświatowa. Jej zadania, metody, organizacja. Podręcznik opracowany staraniem Uniwersytetu Ludowego im. A. Mickiewicza*. Nakładem Michała Arcta w Warszawie. <https://jbc.bj.uj.edu.pl/dlibra/publication/906132/edition/870605?language=en>
- Bozkurt, A., & Ucar, H. (2020). Blockchain technology as a bridging infrastructure among formal, non-formal, and informal learning processes. In R. Sharma, H. Yildirim, & G. Kurubacak (Eds.), *Blockchain Technology Applications in Education* (1–15); IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-5225-9478-9.ch001>.
- Career Explorer. (2024). *How to become an adult education teacher*. <https://www.careerexplorer.com/careers/adult-education-teacher/how-to-become/>
- Chayanopparat, P., Charungkaittikul, S., & Ratana-Ubol, A. (2016). Essential competencies analysis of a training model development for non-formal vocational teachers under the office of the non-formal and informal education in Thailand. *SHS Web of Conferences*, 26, 01068; <https://doi.org/10.1051/SHSCONF/20162601068>.
- Cierzniwska, R. (2017). Przyszłość w/dla edukacji. Obok dyskursu jakości edukacji. In R. Tomaszewska-Lipiec, R. Gerlach (Eds.), *Edukacja dla przyszłości w perspektywie orientacji na rynek pracy* (67–96). Wydawnictwo UKW.

- Dziennik Ustaw 2018 pos. 227. Obwieszczenie Ministra Rodziny, Pracy i Polityki Społecznej z dnia 28 grudnia 2017 r. w sprawie ogłoszenia jednolitego tekstu rozporządzenia Ministra Pracy i Polityki Społecznej w sprawie klasyfikacji zawodów i specjalności na potrzeby rynku pracy oraz zakresu jej stosowania.
- Dziennik Ustaw 2023 pos. 900. Obwieszczenie Marszałka Sejmu Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej z dnia 10 marca 2023 r. w sprawie ogłoszenia jednolitego tekstu ustawy – Prawo oświatowe.
- Euridice. (2023). *Initial education for teachers and trainers working in adult education and training*. <https://eurydice.eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-education-systems/>
- European Commission. (2023). *Adult learning*. <https://education.ec.europa.eu/education-levels/adult-learning>.
- European Training Foundation. (2023). *Country note: Adult learning and education in Ukraine*. <https://openspace.etf.europa.eu/system/files/2024-03/Country%20note%20UA%20final.pdf>
- Galloway, S., & Edwards, R. (2017). Co-producing a recognition of prior learning (RPL) toolkit for adult educators: Reflections on the REAL deal? *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 49(1), 109–125. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02660830.2017.1283756>
- Giannoukos, G., Hioctour, V., Stergio, I., & Kallianta, S. (2016). Andragogy: Prerequisites for adult educators. *World Journal of Education*, 6(4), 53–57. <https://doi.org/10.5430/WJE.V6N4P53>.
- Gouthro, P. (2019). Taking time to learn: The importance of theory for adult education. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 69(1), 60–76. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0741713618815656>
- Grotlüşchen, A., Belzer, A., Ertner, M., & Yasukawa, K. (2024). The role of adult learning and education in the Sustainable Development Goals. *International Review of Education*, 70, 205–221. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-024-10066-w>
- GUS. (2024). *Uczenie się osób dorosłych w 2022 r.* <https://stat.gov.pl/obszary-tematyczne/edukacja/edukacja/uczenie-sie-osob-doroslych-w-2022-roku,22,1.html>
- Informacja o zawodzie andragog 235101. (2018). Ministerstwo Rodziny, Pracy i Polityki Społecznej, Departament Rynku Pracy. <https://www.infodoradca.edu.pl>
- Institute for Adult Learning Singapore. (2024). *Getting started as an adult educator*. <https://www.ial.edu.sg/resources/ae-getting-started/>
- Ioannou, N. (2023). Professional development of adult educators: A European perspective. *International Review of Education*; 7–25. <https://doi.org/10.12681/haea.31755>
- Jakimiuk, B. (2019). Profesjonalizacja nauczycieli dorosłych. *Edukacja Zawodowa i Ustawiczna*, 4, 187–203. https://www.aps.edu.pl/media/3404584/31_eziu_4-2019_b_jakimiuk.pdf
- Karanikola Z, Panagiotopoulos G. (2023). Adult education and globally engaged trainers: The case of vocational training institutes. *Education Sciences*, 13(4), 362. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci13040362>
- Klus-Stańska, D. (2018). *Paradygmaty dydaktyki. Myśleć teorią o praktyce*. Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN.
- Krystoń, M., & Rovňanová, L. (2021). Andragogical competences in university teachers. In Z. Szarota, & Z. Wojciechowska (Eds.), *Learning never ends... Spaces of Adult Education: Central and Eastern European Perspectives* (79–92). Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego. <https://www.wuw.pl/product-eng-15590-Learning-Never-Ends-Spaces-of-Adult-Education-Central-and-Eastern-European-Perspectives-EBOOK.html>
- Kucukaydin, I., & Cranton, P. (2012). Participatory Learning in Formal Adult Education Contexts. *International Journal of Adult Vocational Education and Technology*, 3(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.4018/javet.2012010101>.
- Lattke, S., Jütte, W. (2015). *Professionalisation of adult educators*. Peter Lang Verlag. <https://doi.org/10.3726/978-3-653-04791-2>.
- Loeng, S. (2023). Pedagogy and andragogy in comparison – conceptions and perspectives. *Andragoška Spoznanja / The Andragogic Perspectives & Journal of Adult Education in Slovenia*, 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.4312/as/11482>.

- Lutsan, N. (2021). Trends in adult-education development in Ukraine. In Z. Szarota & Z. Wojciechowska (Eds.), *Learning never ends... Spaces of adult education: Central and Eastern European perspectives* (pp. 58–65). Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego. <https://www.wuw.pl/product-eng-15590-Learning-Never-Ends-Spaces-of-Adult-Education-Central-and-Eastern-European-Perspectives-EBOOK.html>
- Maliszewski, T. (2023). Z dziejów polskiej teorii i praktyki edukacji dorosłych w III Rzeczypospolitej. Akademickie Towarzystwo Andragogiczne (1993–2023). *Rocznik Andragogiczny*, 19–40. <https://apcz.umk.pl/RA/article/view/48252>
- Marczuk, M. (1996). Pracownicy i działacze oświaty dorosłych. In T. Wujek (Ed.), *Wprowadzenie do andragogiki* (pp. 338–339). Wydawnictwo Instytutu Technologii Eksploatacji
- Mazurkiewicz, G. (2009). Adult educators: An example of the new approach to lifelong learning in Poland. *European Journal of Education*, 44(2), 243–255. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1465-3435.2009.01381.x>
- Nychkalo, N., Lukianova, L., Lazarenko, N. (n.d.). Transformation of tasks and functions of adult education in the context of modern society challenges, *Edukacja Zawodowa i Ustawiczna*, 7, 121–134.
- PKD (2023). *Polska Klasyfikacja Działalności*. <https://www.pkd.com.pl/>
- Promyk, K. (1879). *Obrazowa nauka czytania i pisanie do użytku szkolnego, domowego, i jedynie prawdziwa dla samouków*. Wydawnictwo Księgarni Krajowej Konrada Prószyńskiego. <https://polona.pl/item-view/29819b6c-e0b4-4892-b7cf-8cb4c00ab562?page=4>
- Sava, S., & Lupou, R. (2009). The adult educator in Europe – professionalisation challenges and the alternative of validation of learning outcomes. In *Proceedings of the 2009 International Conference on Education, Research and Innovation* (pp. 2227–2232). Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2009.01.392>
- Serwis Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej. (2023a). Departament Strategii, Kwalifikacji i Kształcenia Zawodowego (DSKKZ). <https://www.gov.pl/web/edukacja/departament-strategii-kwalifikacji-i-ksztalcenia-zawodowego-dskkz>
- Serwis Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej. (2023b). Zintegrowany System Kwalifikacji. https://kwalifikacje.gov.pl/k?id_kw=13886
- Shah, S. (2009). Mapping the field of training in adult and lifelong learning in India. In *Teachers and trainers in adult education and lifelong learning professional development in Asia and Europe*, <https://www.die-bonn.de/asem/asem0921.pdf>
- Singh, S., Molina-Naar, M., & Ehlers, S. (2020). Policies for professionalisation in adult learning and education: A comparative study from India, Colombia and Denmark. *Andragoške studije*, 33–61. <https://doi.org/10.5937/AndStud2002033S>
- Skibińska, E. (2012). Akademickie Towarzystwo Andragogiczne – 20 lat działalności. *Rocznik Andragogiczny*, 2012, 79–88.
- Specht, I., & Loreit, F. (2021). Empirical knowledge about person-led guided tours in museums: A scoping review. *Journal of Interpretation Research*, 26(2), 96–130. <https://doi.org/10.1177/10925872211065653>
- Stopińska-Pająk, A. (2003). Pedeutologia andragogiczna Drugiej Rzeczypospolitej w kontekście współczesnych rozważań nad nauczycielem edukacji dorosłych. In D. Ekiert-Oldroyd (Ed.), *Problemy współczesnej pedeutologii. Teoria – praktyka – perspektywy* (pp. 45–58), Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Śląskiego.
- Szarota, Z. (2019). Tasks and Social functions of adult education in the perspective of learning in adulthood. *Pedagogika Społeczna*, 133–148. <https://doi.org/10.35464/1642-672X>
- Szarota, Z., & Pierścieniak, K. (2020). Refleksja andragogiczna – współczesna specyfika dyscypliny. *Studia z Teorii Wychowania*, t. XI, 2(31), 169–188. <https://doi.org/10.5604/01.3001.0014.3654>

- Theiss, W., & Bron Jr, M. (2014). Freedom fighter – instructor – professional: On becoming an adult educator in Poland. *Pedagogika Społeczna*, XIII(2), 49–64. [http://pedagogikaspoeczna.com/wp-content/content/abstrakt/SP%20XIII%20\(2\)%20\(2014\)%2049-64.pdf](http://pedagogikaspoeczna.com/wp-content/content/abstrakt/SP%20XIII%20(2)%20(2014)%2049-64.pdf)
- Veteška, J., & Kolek, J. (2017). Rozvoj andragogiky v České Republice po roce 1989. *Edukacija Doroslych*, 2, 255–264.
- Wesołowska, E.A. (Ed.). (1994a). *Profesjonalizacja akademickiego kształcenia andragogicznego – materiały z polsko-niemieckiej konferencji w Łodzi*, Akademickie Towarzystwo Andragogiczne.
- Wesołowska, E.A. (Ed.). (1994b). *Akademickie programy kształcenia andragogicznego*. Akademickie Towarzystwo Andragogiczne.
- Worek, B., Górniak, J., & Kubica, W. (2022). *Bilans Kapitału Ludzkiego 2022/2021. Rozwój kompetencji – uczenie się dorosłych i sektor szkoleniowo-rozwojowy*. Polska Agencja Rozwoju Przedsiębiorczości. <https://www.parp.gov.pl>
- Yin R.K. (2015). *Studium przypadku w badaniach naukowych. Projektowanie i metody*. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego.
- Zagir, T., & Mandel, K. (2020). Competences of adult learning facilitators in Europe: Analyses of five European research projects. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 10(2), 155–171. <https://doi.org/10.1556/063.2020.00016>.
- Zakon Ukrainy “Pro osvitu doroslykh”. (2022) <https://mon.gov.ua/ua/news/vru-prijnyala-u-pershomu-chitanni-projekt-zu-pro-osvitu-doroslih>